

July 15, 2019

By Hand Delivery

Ms. Lora W. Johnson CMC Clerk of Council Room 1E09, City Hall 1300 Perdido Street New Orleans, LA 70112

In Re: RESOLUTION AND ORDER ESTABLISHING A DOCKET AND OPENING A RULEMAKING PROCEEDING TO ESTABLISH RENEWABLE PORTFOLIO STANDARDS DOCKET NO. UD-19-01

Dear Ms. Johnson,

Please find enclosed an original and three (3) copies of the party 350 New Orleans reply comments in accordance with the procedural schedule established in Resolution R-19-109, with the Service List for the above-mentioned docket. Please file the attached communication and this letter in the record of the proceeding and return one time stamped copy to our courier, in accordance with normal procedures. If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Thank you for your time and consideration.

Best Regards,

Andy Kowalczyk

Just Transition Group

350 New Orleans

DECEIVE A JUL 1.5 2019

BY:____

BEFORE THE

NEW ORLEANS CITY COUNCIL

IN RE: RESOLUTION UD-19-01 DOCKET OPENING RULEMAKING PROCEEDING TO ESTABLISH RENEWABLE PORTFOLIO STANDARDS DOCKET NO. UD-19-01 July 15, 2019

350 NEW ORLEANS

REPLY COMMENTS

350 New Orleans respectfully submits the following comments pursuant to the Resolution and Order Establishing a Docket and Opening a Rulemaking Proceeding to Establish Renewable Portfolio Standards Resolution R-19-109.

Renewable portfolio standard, Clean Energy Standard, City of New Orleans, Utility Cable
Telecommunications and Technology Committee, 350 New Orleans, Alliance for Affordable Energy,
Entergy New Orleans LLC and Midcontinent Independent System Operator and Renewable Energy
Credit will be referred to throughout the comments respectively as 'RPS', 'CES', 'CNO', 'UCTT', '350
NOLA', 'AAE', 'ENO', 'MISO' and 'REC' for the sake of brevity.

Summary

350 New Orleans is a 501(c)(3) climate activist group connecting our region to the international climate change movement led by <u>350.org</u>. Our mission is to lend support to initiatives in New Orleans that raise consciousness and promote sound policy around climate change.

We exist because climate change poses unprecedented threats to life, and coastal Louisiana is especially vulnerable. Rising seas, hotter temperatures, and stronger storms have grave implications for the future of our coasts, communities, and cultures.

We prioritize *locally-grown initiatives* over national ones, and *collaboration* over working alone. We recognize and seek to amplify the power of existing New Orleans- and Gulf-based groups working for climate justice in their own communities.

As an organization we believe that a renewable energy mandate that addresses the issues of equity, resilience and reliability are foundational for the future of the city. The reality of climate change is undeniable and daunting in its implications and requires not only bold and sweeping action, but also accountability from current industries responsible for greenhouse gas emissions, and specific to this proceeding, utilities in the power sector. The following comments are in response to comments filed June 3, 2019 regarding UD-19-01 by CNO's sole electricity utility, the investor owned Entergy New Orleans LLC.

ENO proposal for a Clean Energy Standard

Climate change, put succinctly by Dr. Kim Nicholas of Lund University in Sweden, can be reduced to five basic principles regarding the climate, "It's warming, It's us, We're sure, It's bad and We can fix it".

It's warming: According to an ongoing temperature analysis conducted by scientists at NASA's Goddard Institute for Space Studies (GISS), the average global temperature on Earth has increased by about 0.8° Celsius (1.4° Fahrenheit) since 1880. Two-thirds of the warming has occurred since 1975, at a rate of roughly 0.15-0.20°C per decade. ¹

It's us: During ice ages, the CO₂ levels were around 200 ppm, and during the warmer interglacial periods, the levels were around 280 ppm (parts per million). In late May 2019 CO2 concentration in the atmosphere reached 415 ppm.² Looking ahead, if the rate of fossil-fuel burning continues to rise on a business-as-usual trajectory, such that humanity exhausts the reserves over the next few centuries, CO₂ would continue to rise to levels of order 1500 ppm.³

We're Sure: 97% of climate scientists agree that climate change is happening.⁴ Additionally, our actions have set in motion a sixth global mass extinction of species; the destruction of whole ecosystems is a further threat to our own survival.⁵ However, simply observing the economic effects of climate change in relation to climate related disasters provides a clear picture of the magnitude of this threat.

¹ NASA Earth Observatory World of Change: Global Temperatures - https://earthobservatory.nasa.gov/world-of-change/DecadalTemp

² National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA) Earth System Research Laboratory https://www.esrl.noaa.gov/gmd/ccgg/trends/weekly.html

³ Scripps Institute of Oceanography: Keeling Curve Lessons - http://scrippsco2.ucsd.edu/history_legacy/keeling_curve_lessons

⁴ NASA Global Climate Change Vital Signs of the Planet - https://climate.nasa.gov/scientific-consensus/

⁵ Business Insider "18 signs we're in the middle of a 6th mass extinction" <u>https://www.businessinsider.com/signs-of-6th-mass-extinction-2019-3</u>

It's Bad: According to data journalist Niall McCarthy, "Between 1978 and 1997, the total estimated economic cost of climate-related disasters such as storms, droughts, floods and heatwaves worldwide was \$895 billion (in 2017 dollars). In the 20-year period from 1998 to 2017, that skyrocketed 151% to a whopping \$2.25 trillion. The U.S. had the worst economic losses during the latter timeframe with \$944.8 billion, followed by China with \$492.2 billion and Japan with \$376.3 billion." We have set in motion hundreds of years of sea level rise, but the speed and long term magnitude of sea level rise is depending on our efforts today to drastically reduce greenhouse gas emissions now. According to the IPCC, we have no more than 11 years to cut GHG emissions by 45% and by 100% by 2050 in order to have any chance to stay below a 1.5 degree C warming and avoid devastating climate tipping points. For the sake of our own children, we have the moral imperative to do all we can to bring down greenhouse gas emissions drastically and fast. The New Orleans City Council has the chance to set an example for the entire US Southeast.

We can fix it: Any proposal entertained that does not clearly mandate and enforce through regulatory means a transition to 100% renewable energy for the power sector before 2050 represents a risk for human populations and ecosystems worldwide. For this reason, we believe that the CES proposed by ENO is inadequate in decarbonizing CNO's supply of energy to the city's ratepayers.

UD-19-109 Resolution and Order Establishing a Docket and Opening a Rulemaking Proceeding to Establish Renewable Portfolio Standards, passed unanimously by the CNO Utility, Cable, Telecommunications and Technology Committee included no mention of a CES as an alternative to an RPS. The clearest impetus for the current rulemaking UD-19-01 can be attributed to the June 28th 2018 UCTT meeting wherein Executive Director Logan Burke of AAE voiced the value of a renewable portfolio standard to help address the egregious lack of progress on behalf of ENO in showing progress on delivering 100MW of solar generation, and CNO Councilmember Giarrusso voiced support for establishing a rulemaking proceeding to establish renewable portfolio standards through a recommendation to CNO Council President and UCTT Chairwoman Moreno⁸. It's clear from the video recording of the entirety of this meeting that there is an unfavorable history of depending on ENO to deliver on, or prioritize commitments to renewables identified by ENO as a priority. Furthermore, the

_

⁶ Forbes "The Cost Of Climate-Related Disasters Has Soared In The 21st Century" https://www.forbes.com/sites/niallmccarthy/2018/10/12/the-cost-of-climate-related-disasters-soared-in-the-21st-century-infographic/#3aea9b437 976

⁷ https://report.ipcc.ch/sr15/pdf/sr15 spm_final.pdf

⁸ https://council.nola.gov/meetings/ - http://cityofno.granicus.com/player/clip/2995?view_id=42 - 48:23, 56:18

intention of Resolution UD-19-111 is focused primarily on increasing the renewable energy footprint, with no language referring to 'clean energy', involving nuclear assets.

The history of CES's by and large carry a similar lack of credibility in that there is no reliable body of evidence to support claims that they are superior to RPS's in addressing decarbonization. There is however, ample evidence provided by Lawrence Berkeley National Laboratory that establishes RPS's account for nearly 45% of growth in renewables nationwide, with incentives and cost declines accounting for the remaining growth.

The claim that RPS's raise electricity rates by a University of Chicago paper released before peer review has been largely debunked. 10 The most significant claim is treating all RPS's the same and determining a mean average across all markets, when both markets and regional RPS's differ widely from each other. Additionally, much of the work released from The University of Chicago regarding regulation is to be viewed with skepticism. As conveyed by the writer David Cay Johnston "The Chicago School... assumes good behavior by people and has unquestioned faith in markets to correct themselves without any interference by government. To the Chicago School, regulation is regarded as a drag on the economy."11

Inaccuracies or incomplete data

A common occurrence throughout ENO's opening comments seems to be a lack of data supporting figures used to demonstrate factual data or projections.

Figure 1 on page 4 of ENO's opening June 3rd 2019 comments does not provide information regarding inputs used to create the model depicting ENO's Carbon Dioxide Emission Rate Compared to National Average.

Page 9 of ENO's June 3rd 2019 opening comments also incorrectly asserts that Union of Concerned Scientists "increasingly recognize and publicly state the importance of preserving existing nuclear

² Lawrence Berkeley National Laboratory - http://eta-publications.lbl.gov/sites/default/files/2018 annual rps summary report.pdf 10 Advanced Energy Economy -

https://blog.aee.net/university-of-chicago-analysis-of-rps-is-a-working-paper-that-still-needs-work?utm content=90330278&utm medium=socia <u>l&utm_source=twitter&hss_channel=tw-403019655</u>

I The Fine Print - How Big Companies "Use Plain English" to Rob You Blind, David Cay Johnston - (pg 241)

capacity to help address climate change concerns." The official position of Union of Concerned Scientists however presents the aging United States nuclear fleet as a potentially costly dilemma for ratepayers. Evidence suggests that all of ENO's nuclear assets are currently operating at a loss. 12

Pages 10, 35, 47 ENO's June 3rd 2019 opening comments also refer to nuclear as dispatchable, which lacks credibility in that it can take hours to ramp nuclear generation to meet demand, and in the case of ENO's Grand Gulf, this premise is dependent on whether or not it is available as a resource.

Reliability and Cost Issues of ENO's Aging Nuclear Assets

The question of the reliability of Grand Gulf Nuclear Station, built in 1985, which ENO has a 90% stake in presents a specific problem. Original licensing permits issued from the Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC) for nuclear power plants last 40 years, with an extension of 20 if a plant meets compliance standards.¹³ Currently, Grand Gulf Nuclear Station is 33 years old, and yet is already experiencing significant issues in reliability. From 2013 - 2018 it is estimated Grand Gulf has been either at zero or reduced power 47.5% of the days measured by the Nuclear Regulatory Commision.¹⁴

Relying on this asset presents a climate liability, but it's apparent that there is a cost liability to ratepayers as well. It's vital that a multifaceted strategy is put in place as soon as possible to build a robust infrastructure capable of delivering distributed and large scale renewable energy to CNO ratepayers at an affordable cost in a city which suffers one of the highest rates of energy burden in the country.¹⁵ This is of vital importance as ENO ratepayers are allegedly subject to costly arrangements that unnecessarily drive up ratepayer costs with assets like Grand Gulf Nuclear Station owned by company subsidiary System Energy Resources Inc as well.¹⁶ The possibility of building new nuclear assets in coming years at an affordable cost is an even greater challenge as is evident in the case of the state of Georgia's Alvin W. Vogtle Electric Generating Plant, whose reactors 3 and 4 will require an expenditure of a \$27 billion dollars to complete construction by 2021/2022. Construction of these assets furthermore began in 2009, requiring 13 years for completion at a time when CO2 emissions are quickly and steadily rising.¹⁷ Put

¹² Union of Concerned Scientists -https://www.ucsusa.org/nuclear-power/cost-nuclear-power/retirements

¹³ https://www.nrc.gov/reactors/new-reactors/col.html

¹⁴ E & E News "Downtime at 'aging' Grand Gulf attracts increased scrutiny" December 4, 2018 - https://www.eenews.net/stories/1060108635/

¹⁵ American Council for an Energy Efficient Economy (ACEEE) - https://aceee.org/sites/default/files/pdf/fact-sheet/ses-louisiana-100917.pdf

¹⁶ Union of Concerned Scientists "This Crazy Trick Could Help New Orleans Utility Customers Save Money" https://blog.ucsusa.org/joseph-daniel/this-crazy-trick-could-help-new-orleans-utility-customers-save-money

¹⁷ POWER "How the Vogtle Nuclear Expansion's Costs Escalated"https://www.powermag.com/how-the-vogtle-nuclear-expansions-costs-escalated/?pagenum=1

simply, at a time when much of the nuclear fleet nationally is being retired, not operating at full capacity, operating at a financial loss, ENO and CNO needs to reconsider traditional centralized models of meeting customer demand and to instead consider distributed resources, energy efficiency and other customer programs that increase resilience.

A Path to Accountability and Equity

The challenges presented by climate related weather events to 19.7% of New Orleans residents who live in poverty demands action. It's vital that an RPS outlining greater renewable energy integration to CNO's grid has clear goals and carveouts aimed at resilience measures, ratepayer programs including energy efficiency and demand response, and additional large scale generation. Increasing low income access to the benefits of rooftop and community solar programs would have sweeping benefits, not just to individual homes in the form of more affordable energy access, but also to the local community in the form of jobs and equity.

These are necessary goals that have been promised through efforts in the past from ENO, but cannot happen without accountability from ENO. For this reason it is necessary to establish an advisory council comprised of New Orleanians that represent CNO, and can further the technical needs of the RPS, as well as affordable housing, affordable energy, cultural preservation, resilience needs, and workforce development. This committee will provide oversight of the process by which ENO seeks to meet RPS goals and make recommendations to the UCTT.

The rules of the RPS itself must include a method of holding the utility accountable for not meeting renewable energy targets. 350 NOLA recommends that in the years that renewable energy targets are not met, ENO executive pay or bonuses be directly tied to the success or failure to meet such goals. This ensures as great of a drive towards success in building or procuring a robust renewable energy infrastructure serving CNO as it does a prohibition against failure to meet goals.

Conclusion

To increase the footprint of renewable energy in CNO that carries aggregate benefits and resilience for ratepayers and the community, the CES goal or standard identified by ENO in the July 3rd opening comments is inadequate. RPS goals are not only achievable but effective, which is why many states are increasing their renewable energy targets. This effectiveness however relies on accountability, and an RPS that is informed and guided by the ratepayers of CNO will provide perhaps the greatest resource of

all. Their invaluable insight and experience will reveal the promise and ability of the city to meet the challenges of climate change.

RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED THIS 15Th DAY OF JULY, 2019

Andy Kowalczyk

Just Transition Group
1115 Congress St

New Orleans, LA, 70117 Phone: 415-676-1047

Email: a.kowalcyzk350no@gmail.com

7/15/2019

Renate Heurich Vice President

1407 Napoleon Ave,#C New Orleans, LA, 70115 Phone: 504-473-2740

Email: renate@350neworleans.org

Marion Freistadt Heart and Muscle Cohort

1539 Adams St.

New Orleans, LA 70118 Phone: 504-352-2142

Email: marionfreistadt@yahoo.com

Ben Quimby Treasurer

1621 S. Rampart St. New Orleans, LA 70113

Phone: 978-505-7649

Email: ben@350neworleans.org

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing has been served by hand delivery to the Clerk of Council with a copy to the Director, Council Utilities Regulatory Office, and upon all known parties of record via electronic mail.

New Orleans, Louisiana this 15th day of July, 2019.

Andy Kowalczyk

July 15,2019

RULEMAKING PROCEEDING TO ESTABLISH RENEWABLE PORTFOLIO STANDARDS

DOCKET UD-19-01

Lora W. Johnson, lwjohnson@nola.gov
Clerk of Council
City Hall - Room 1E09
1300 Perdido Street
New Orleans, LA 70112
(504) 658-1085 - office

(504) 658-1140 - fax

Service of Discovery not required

Erin Spears, espears@nola.gov

Chief of Staff, Council Utilities Regulatory Office

Bobbie Mason, bfmason1@nola.gov

City Hall - Room 6E07

1300 Perdido Street

New Orleans, LA 70112

(504) 658-1110 - office

(504) 658-1117 - fax

Andrew Tuozzolo, CM Moreno Chief of Staff, avtuozzolo@nola.gov

1300 Perdido St. Rm. 2W40

New Orleans, LA. 70112

David Gavlinski, 504-658-1101, dsgavlinski@nola.gov

Council Chief of Staff City Hall - Room 1E06 1300 Perdido Street New Orleans, LA 70112

Sunni LeBeouf, Sunni.LeBeouf@nola.gov

Law Department
City Hall - 5th Floor
New Orleans, LA 70112
(504) 658-9800 - office
(504) 658-9869 - fax
Service of Discovery not required

Norman White, Norman. White @nola.gov

Department of Finance City Hall - Room 3E06 1300 Perdido Street New Orleans, LA 70112 (504) 658-1502- office (504) 658-1705 – fax

Jonathan M. Rhodes, Jonathan. Rhodes@nola.gov

Director of Utilities, Mayor's Office City Hall – Room 2E04 1300 Perdido Street New Orleans, LA 70112 (504) 658-4928 - Office

ADMINISTRATIVE HEARING OFFICER

Hon. Jeffrey S. Gulin, judgegulin@gmail.com 3203 Bridle Ridge Lane Lutherville, MD 2109 (410) 627-5357

NEW ORLEANS CITY COUNCIL CONSULTANTS

Clinton A. Vince, clinton.vince@dentons.com
Presley Reed, presley.reedjr@dentons.com
Emma F. Hand, emma.hand@dentons.com
1900 K Street NW
Washington, DC 20006

(202) 408-6400 - office (202) 408-6399 - fax

Basile J. Uddo (504) 583-8604 cell, buddo@earthlink.net

J. A. "Jay Beatmann, Jr. (504) 256-6142 cell, (504) 524-5446 office direct,

jay.beatmann@dentons.com

c/o DENTONS US LLP

650 Poydras Street

Suite 2850

New Orleans, LA 70130

Joseph W. Rogers, jrogers@elegendcgl.com

Victor M. Prep, vprep@legendcgl.com

Byron S. Watson, bwatson@legendcgl.com

Cortney Crouch, ccrouch@legendcgl.com

Legend Consulting Group

6041 South Syracuse Way, Suite 105

Greenwood Village, CO 80111

(303) 843-0351 - office

(303) 843-0529 – fax

Errol Smith, (504) 284-8733, ersmith@btcpas.com

Bruno and Tervalon

4298 Elysian Fields Avenue

New Orleans, LA 70122

(504) 284-8296 – fax

ENTERGY NEW ORLEANS, LLC

Brian L. Guillot, 504-670-3680, bguill @entergy.com

Entergy New Orleans, LLC

Vice-President, Regulatory Affairs

Polly S. Rosemond, 504-670-3567, prosemo@entergy.com

Derek Mills, 504-670-3527, dmills3@entergy.com

Keith Wood, kwood@entergy.com

Seth Cureington, 504-670-3602, scurein@entergy.com

Kevin T. Boleware, 504-670-3673, kbolewa@entergy.com

1600 Perdido Street, L-MAG 505B

New Orleans, LA 70112

504-670-3615 fax

Tim Cragin (504) 576-6571, tcragin@entergy.com
Alyssa Maurice-Anderson (504) 576-6523, amauric@entergy.com
Harry Barton (504) 576-2984, hbarton@entergy.com
Entergy Services, LLC
Mail Unit L-ENT-26E
639 Loyola Avenue
New Orleans, LA 70113
(504) 576-5579 - fax

Joe Romano, III (504) 576-4764, jromanl@entergy.com
Suzanne Fontan (504) 576-7497, sfontan@entergy.com
Therese Perrault (504) 576-6950, tperrau@entergy.com
Entergy Services, LLC
Mail Unit L-ENT-4C
639 Loyola Avenue
New Orleans, LA 70113
(504)576-6029 – fax

ALLIANCE FOR AFFORDABLE ENERGY

Logan Atkinson Burke, logan@all4energy.org
Sophie Zaken, regulatory@all4energy.org
4505 S. Claiborne Ave.
New Orleans, LA. 70125

350 NEW ORLEANS

Renate Heurich, 504-473-2740, renate@350neworleans.org 1407 Napoleon Ave,#C New Orleans, LA, 70115

Andy Kowalczyk, a.kowalczyk350no@gmail.com 1115 Congress St. New Orleans, LA 70117

Benjamin Quimby, 978-505-7649, ben@350neworleans.org 1621 S. Rampart St.
New Orleans, LA 70113

Marion Freistadt, 504-352-2142, marionfreistadt@yahoo.com 1539 Adams St. New Orleans, LA 70118

CENTER FOR CLIMATE AND ENERGY SOLUTIONS

Bob Perciasepe, 703-516-4146, PerciasepeB@c2es.org
Marty Niland, Press@c2es.org
3100 Clarendon Blvd, Suite 800
Arlington, VA 22201

GULF STATES RENEWABLE ENERGY INDUSTRIES ASSOCIATION

Stephen Wright, 318-663-3810, swright@gsreia.org
522 Marilyn Dr.
Mandeville, LA 70448

Jeff Cantin, 877-785-2664, jcantin@gsreia.org 2803 St. Philip St.
New Orleans, LA 70119

NATIONAL AUDUBON SOCIETY

Karen J. Profita, 225-768-0820, kprofita@audubon.org
Gary Moody, gmoody@audubon.org
5615 Corporate Blvd., Suite 600B
Baton Rouge, La. 70808

SOUTHERN RENEWABLE ENERGY ASSOCIATION

Simon Mahan, 337-303-3723, simon@southernwind.org 5120 Chessie Circle Haltom City, Texas 76137

AIR PRODUCTS AND CHEMICALS, INC.

Katherine W. King, Katherine.king@keanmiller.ocm
Randy Young, randy.young@kean miller.com
400 Convention St. Suite 700
Baton Rouge, LA. 70802
Or
P.O. Box 3513
Baton Rouge, LA 70821-3513

Carrie R. Tournillon, carrie.tournillon@keanmiller.com

900 Poydras St., Suite 3600 New Orleans, LA 70112

Maurice Brubaker, mbrubaker@consultbai.com

16690 Swigly Ridge Rd., Suite 140 Chesterfield, MO 63017 Or P.O. Box 412000 Chesterfield, MO. 63141-2000

NEW ORLEANS CHAMBER

G. Ben Johnson, (504) 799-4260, <u>bjohnson@neworleanschamber.org</u> 1515 Poydras Street, Suite 1010
New Orleans, La. 70112

SIERRA CLUB

Grace Morris, 973-997-7121 <u>Grace.Morris@sierraclub.org</u> 4422 Bienville Ave New Orleans, LA 70119

Dave Stets, 804-222-4420, Davidmstets@gmail.com
2101 Selma St.

New Orleans, LA 70122

Joshua Smith, joshua.smith@sierraclub.org

Lauren Hogrewe, Jauren.hogrewe@sierraclub.org
2101 Webster Street, Suite 1300

Oakland, California 94612-3011

(415) 977-5660

POSIGEN SOLAR

Elizabeth Galante, 504-293-4819, <u>bgalante@posigen.com</u>
Ben Norwood, 504-293-4819, <u>bnorwood@posigen.com</u>
819 Central Avenue, Suite 201
Jefferson, La. 70121

VOTE SOLAR

Thadeus B. Culley, 504-616-0181, <u>thad@votesolar.org</u> 1911 Ephesus Church Road Chapel Hill, North Carolina 27517

DEEP SOUTH CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE

Monique Harden, 504-510-2943, moniqueh@dscej.org 3157 Gentilly Boulevard, #145

New Orleans, La. 70122