ICF Team

Karen Ehrhardt-Martinez, PhD – Director, Behavioral Science and Customer Insights
Thomas Glendening – Director, Residential Programs
Noah Purcell – Project Management
DTE Team

❖ Kevin Bilyeu
❖ Josh Martens
❖ Jose Goncalves
❖ David Becker
-Chinyere Osuala – Earthjustice
-Cassandra McCrae – Earthjustice
- Sharonda Williams-Tack – Sierra Club
- Elena Saxonhouse – Sierra Club

→ Stakeholders
1. Equity Insights Progress to Date (10 Minutes)

2. Phase III Work
   a) Task 1: Targeting and Tailoring Strategy (10 Minutes)
   b) Task 2: Behavior Optimization (15 Mins)
   c) Task 3: Implementation Strategy (10 Mins)

3. Phase 3 Draft Plan (15 Mins)

4. Q&A and Next Steps (30 Minutes)
DTE Equity Insights Study Snapshot:

- **Phase One: Equity Metrics**
  - Geographic Targeting data evaluated for survey delivery

- **Phase Two: Community Surveys**
  - 600 Target Completes
  - 5/26: Survey One fielded begin
  - 7/11: Summary of Surveys 1–3 completed
  - 8/1: Surveys Six concluded
  - End of August: Summary of all surveys

→ Equity Insights Progress–to–Date Recap
Phase Two All Surveys Snapshot:
• 2,090 unique respondents
• 122 Questions including Intake Survey and Contingent Questions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fielding Dates</th>
<th>Survey 1</th>
<th>Survey 2</th>
<th>Survey 3</th>
<th>Survey 4</th>
<th>Survey 5</th>
<th>Survey 6</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Postcard Invitation</td>
<td>15,541*</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Email Invitation</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>13,083</td>
<td>13,056</td>
<td>13,051</td>
<td>13,050</td>
<td>13,047</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First Email Reminder</td>
<td>13,056</td>
<td>811*</td>
<td>12,509</td>
<td>12,514</td>
<td>12,547</td>
<td>12,503</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Second Email Reminder</td>
<td>12,469</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>12,434</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>469**</td>
<td>1,261**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Response Rate</td>
<td>7.2%</td>
<td>5.6%</td>
<td>5.4%</td>
<td>5.9%</td>
<td>6.1%</td>
<td>5.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Completions</td>
<td>1,118</td>
<td>737</td>
<td>709</td>
<td>771</td>
<td>792</td>
<td>776</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Completed All Surveys To-Date</td>
<td>433</td>
<td>431</td>
<td>416</td>
<td>389</td>
<td>377</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Postcards were sent to all potential respondents, including those without email addresses
**Sent to nonrespondents who completed a prior survey

Equity Insights Progress-to-Date Recap
Phase Two All Surveys Findings Snapshot:

- Net Promoter Scores increased 82% among the respondents between Surveys 1–3 and Survey 6.

**NPS6.** How likely you are to recommend DTE to a friend or family member?

NPS is a common metric used in customer experience programs to measures loyalty of customers to a company

$$\text{NPS} = \% \text{ of Promoters (9-10 on scale)} - \% \text{ of Detractors (0-6 on scale)}$$

*Only Survey Respondents from 1 – 3 were asked on Survey 6

**NPS Score not connected to scoring conducted for other DTE or program evaluator efforts

---

Equity Insights Progress-to-Date Recap
**Phase Three Timeline**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Step</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Develop Targeting and Tailoring Strategy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Draft Targeting and Tailoring Strategy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Behavioral Optimization through Choice Architecture and Nudges</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Contractor Interviews</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>CAA/Stakeholder Workshop Prep and Delivery</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Finalization of Strategy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Implementation Planning and Coordination</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Progress Schedule

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>July</th>
<th>Aug</th>
<th>Sept</th>
<th>Oct</th>
<th>Nov</th>
<th>Dec</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sierra Club Responsive Comments, Docket UD-22-04, Exhibit 9
DTE Equity & Inclusion Study
Phase Three: Targeting and Tailoring Strategy
Targeting and Tailoring Strategy Goals

- Reflect insights from Phase One Geographic Targeting and Phase Two Engagement Surveys to:
  - determine potential of Neighborhood-based approach
  - specify how best to select and engage households
  - determine range of measures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Phase 3: Targeted, Behavioral Science Based Engagement</th>
<th>July</th>
<th>Aug</th>
<th>Sept</th>
<th>Oct</th>
<th>Nov</th>
<th>Dec</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Develop Targeting and Tailoring Strategy</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Draft Targeting and Tailoring Strategy</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Behavioral Optimization through Choice Architecture and Nudges</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Contractor Interviews</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 CAA/Stakeholder Workshop Prep and Delivery</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Finalization of Strategy</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Implementation Planning and Coordination</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

→ Targeting and Tailoring Strategy
Gas and Electric Energy Burden > 40% in Top Quintile
Electric Energy Burden > 40% in Top Quintile
Gas Energy Burden > 40% in Top Quintile
Below 40% in Electric and Gas Top Quintile Energy Burden

PUMA | Census Tracts | SF IQ with Mailing Address | SF IQ with Email
--- | --- | --- | ---
3208 | 16 | 7,145 | 5,545
3210 | 15 | 5,628 | 4,380
31 | 31 | 12,773 | 9,925

*Sample later expanded*
Targeting and Tailoring Next Step:

- Survey Respondents mapped by census tract within each PUMA
Targeting and Tailoring Next Step:

• Deeper analysis of Census Tracts to best focus resources

Respondents Completing at Least One Survey
Targeting and Tailoring Challenges and Opportunities

- Challenge of balancing limited funds available for Whole Home Approach with depth of community reach
- Opportunity to leverage and integrate information from Community Surveys
- Opportunity to leverage insights from other Phase 3 tasks (e.g., contractor/CAA interviews and behavioral science insights)

→ Targeting and Tailoring Strategy
Targeting and Tailoring Challenges and Opportunities

- Challenge of balancing limited funds available for Whole Home Approach with depth of community reach
- Opportunity to leverage and integrate information from Community Surveys
- Opportunity to leverage insights from other Phase 3 tasks (e.g., contractor/CAA interviews and behavioral science insights)

Items of Focus:
- Air Sealing and Insulation
- Workforce Development contractor involvement

Under Consideration:
- Neighborhood Direct Install Blitz Campaign – potential measures: Smart or programmable Tstats and/or furnace filters
- Safety Measure partnerships
- Neighbor to Neighbor Education Opportunities

Targeting and Tailoring Strategy
DTE Equity & Inclusion Study
Phase Three: Behavioral Optimization through Nudges and Choice Architecture
**Behavioral Optimization Goals**

Weave social and behavioral science insights from Community Surveys with EEA program design to create recommendations to shape:

- customer behavior and engagement
- contractors, CAAs, and other program stakeholder’s interactions

---

### Phase 3: Targeted, Behavioral Science Based Engagement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Step</th>
<th>July</th>
<th>Aug</th>
<th>Sept</th>
<th>Oct</th>
<th>Nov</th>
<th>Dec</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Develop Targeting and Tailoring Strategy</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Draft Targeting and Tailoring Strategy</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Behavioral Optimization through Choice Architecture and Nudges</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Contractor Interviews</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. CAA/Stakeholder Workshop Prep and Delivery</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Finalization of Strategy</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Implementation Planning and Coordination</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

→ **Behavioral Optimization**
Behavioral Optimization Strategy

- Addresses key challenges and barriers associated with program design and those identified in community surveys
- Maximizes program participation, customer engagement, and program impact

→ Behavioral Optimization
Survey results to drive behavioral nudges and choice architecture to maximize customer engagement, good will, and energy savings impact

Survey Three Results:

• **Thermostat Settings**
  
  • Close to half of customers (45%) have **non-programmable thermostats** while only a small amount (7%) of customers reported having a smart or WiFi–enabled thermostat in their home.
  
  • On average in winter, customers set their temperature to roughly **71 degrees**, with **little difference between day and night temperature settings**.

→ **Behavioral Optimization Process Example**
Survey results to drive behavioral nudges and choice architecture to maximize customer engagement, good will, and energy savings impact

Survey Three Results:

- **HVAC System Air Filters**
  - Over half (58%) of respondents are only changing their furnace filters twice a year or less.

- **Air Sealing**
  - The majority (88%) of customers state their homes have a draft.
  - If customers need to caulk around windows or install weather stripping to reduce air leaks, close to half of customers (42.5%) said they would do the work themselves.

→ Behavioral Optimization Process Example
DTE Equity & Inclusion Study
Phase Three: Implementation
Strategy, Planning, and Coordination
Implementation Strategy, Planning, and Coordination Goals

Work with DTE and stakeholders to develop:

- implementation strategy with DTE and stakeholders.
- participation goals and metrics for Geographic Targeting Approach.
- insights for program updates (e.g., planning for updates, collateral modifications, etc.).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Phase 3: Targeted, Behavioral Science Based Engagement</th>
<th>July</th>
<th>Aug</th>
<th>Sept</th>
<th>Oct</th>
<th>Nov</th>
<th>Dec</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Develop Targeting and Tailoring Strategy</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Draft Targeting and Tailoring Strategy</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Behavioral Optimization through Choice Architecture and Nudges</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Contractor Interviews</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 CAA/Stakeholder Workshop Prep and Delivery</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Finalization of Strategy</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Implementation Planning and Coordination</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

→ Implementation Strategy, Planning, and Coordination
Implementation Strategy, Planning, and Coordination Next Steps

- Contractor and Program Partner Interviews
  - Current and Upcoming contractors
- Learning from Contractor and Program Partner interviews rolled into Program Partner/Stakeholder Workshop
  - Focus on groups near PUMAs 3208 and 3210 (e.g., Matrix, Wayne–Metro)
DTE Equity & Inclusion Study
Phase Three Draft Plan
Currently assessing reach of resources to determine number of houses receiving Assessment and Wx measures.

- Health and Safety Issues referred to Health and Safety Pilot process
- Electrically heated homes identified as potential candidates for heat pump installation

Homes within identified community offered energy assessment with direct install measures.

- Exploring opportunities to partner with other community focused efforts (e.g., Detroit Fire Department provision of smoke and carbon monoxide detectors)

Host community meeting to gather feedback and highlight benefits of energy efficiency, enhanced comfort of home, and opportunities to increase savings.
DTE Equity & Inclusion Study
Q&A and Next Steps
Next Steps

- Phase 2 Survey Summaries Presentation
- Phase Three Draft Plan Workshop
Appendix
A large portion (41%) of respondents reported having programmable thermostats but close to half of customers (45%) have non-programmable thermostats while only a small amount (7%) of customers reported having a smart or WiFi-enabled thermostat in their home. About half (49.9%) of customers rarely change the temperature on the thermostat throughout the day.

**Number of Times per Day Customers Change the Thermostat Setting**

- 49.9% Rarely – we mostly don’t change the thermostat settings
- 38.1% Once or twice a day
- 10.7% Three or more times per day
- 1.3% Other

**Thermostat Type and Adjustment**

- **45.0%** Non-Programmable
- **40.6%** Programmable
- **6.8%** Smart or WiFi-Enabled
- **1.0%** Other
- **6.6%** Don’t know

*Source: ICF analysis*
Temperature Settings

On average, customers set their temperature to roughly 71 degrees, with little difference between day and night temperature settings.

During the winter, are most members of your household generally too hot, too cold, or perfectly comfortable?

- Too hot, 3.4%
- Too cold, 26.6%
- Just right, 40.0%
- Some are too hot while others are too cold, 30.1%

Average Temperature Settings
- Average set point: 71 degrees
- During the day: 71.5 degrees
- At night: 72.2 degrees
Home Heating and Cooling Maintenance

Over half (58%) of respondents are only changing their furnace filters twice a year or less.

Frequency of Cleaning or Changing the Furnace Filter

- Every month: 8.2%
- Every 2-3 months: 33.3%
- Twice a year: 19.0%
- Once a year: 22.7%
- Less than once per year: 16.7%

Source: ICF analysis
Drafts and Air Leaks

The majority (88.1%) of customers state their homes have a draft.
If customers need to caulk around windows or install weather stripping to reduce air leaks, close to half of customers (42.5%) said they would do the work themselves.

What Customers Would Do to Caulk Around Windows or Install Weather Stripping

- Do the work yourself 42.5%
- Get a friend/family member to... 25.7%
- Hire a contractor or professional 12.5%
- Do nothing due to cost... 9.8%
- Do nothing due to other factors 2.1%
- Other, please specify 2.4%
- I don’t know 4.9%
Interacting With Neighbors

Over half (54%) of respondents speak with their neighbors every day or several times per week.

How often do you talk to any of your neighbors living on the same street or nearby?

- Every day (or nearly every day): 21.9%
- Several times per week: 32.5%
- Once per week: 12.9%
- Once or twice per month: 12.8%
- Every few months: 4.4%
- A few times per year: 4.9%
- Never or almost never: 10.6%

Source: ICF analysis

Sierra Club Responsive Comments, Docket UD-22-04, Exhibit 9
1. Awareness, Experiences, and Perceptions of DTE and IQ Programs

2. Home Related Challenges and Joys

3. HVAC Concerns, Maintenance, and Temp Settings

4. Resilience, Self-Reliance, and Community Connections

5. Security of Food, Health, Housing, and Energy

6. Household Composition, Demographics, and Home Use

*Each survey respondent will also complete a short entry-point survey

→ Behavioral Optimization: Community Survey Themes