

Entergy Services, Inc. 639 Loyola Avenue

P. O. Box 61000 New Orleans, LA 70161-1000

Tel 504 576 6523 Fax 504 576 5579 amauric@entergy.com

Alyssa Maurice-Anderson Assistant General Counsel Legal Department -- Regulatory

November 6, 2018

Lora W. Johnson, CMC, LMMC Clerk of Council Room 1E09, City Hall 1300 Perdido Street New Orleans, LA 70112

Re:

Revised Application of Entergy New Orleans, LLC for a Change in

Electric and Gas Rates Pursuant to Council Resolutions R-15-194

and R-17-504 and for Related Relief Council Docket No. UD-18-07

Dear Ms. Johnson:

On behalf of Entergy New Orleans, LLC ("ENO" or the Company), please find enclosed for your further handling an original and three copies of Opposition to the Crescent City Power Users' Group Motion for Intervention and Motion to Strike, which I would appreciate your filing into the record of this proceeding. Please file an original and two copies into the record in the above referenced matter, and return a date-stamped copy to our courier.

Should you have any questions regarding the above/attached, please do not hesitate to contact me.

With kindest regards, I am

Sincerely,

Alyssa Maurice-Anderson

/ama Enclosures

cc:

Official Service List via email

Mr. Luke F. Piontek

PECEIVEN Nov-0 6:2018

Nov = 3 24

#### **BEFORE THE**

#### COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF NEW ORLEANS

APPLICATION OF ENTERGY NEW	)	
ORLEANS, LLC FOR A CHANGE IN	)	
ELECTRIC AND GAS RATES	)	
PURSUANT TO COUNCIL	)	DOCKET NO. UD-18-07
RESOLUTIONS R-15-194 AND R-17-504	)	
FORMULA RATE PLAN AND FOR	)	
AND FOR RELATED RELIEF	)	

# ENTERGY NEW ORLEANS, LLC'S OPPOSITION TO THE CRESCENT CITY POWER USERS' GROUP MOTION FOR INTERVENTION AND ENTERGY NEW ORLEANS, LLC'S MOTION TO STRIKE

#### NOW BEFORE THE COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF NEW ORLEANS comes

Entergy New Orleans, LLC ("ENO" or the "Company"), through undersigned counsel, and submits its opposition to the motion for intervention filed by the Crescent City Power Users' Group ("CCPUG") and ENO's motion to strike the same. ENO opposes the CCPUG's intervention because CCPUG, an alleged unincorporated association, has not provided sufficient proof of a justiciable or administratively cognizable interest to support intervention in this proceeding.

CCPUG served a three-page motion for intervention with scant factual information concerning CCPUG. The motion alleges that (1) CCPUG is an unincorporated association comprised of "large ratepayers," (2) a change in electric and gas rates "will directly affect the business and economic interests of CCPUG," and (3) no other intervenor or party will adequately protect CCPUG's interests.

1

Section 158-287 of the Code of the City of New Orleans indicates that the method for challenging an intervention is a motion to strike. Therefore, in an abundance of caution, ENO has referred to its pleading as both an opposition to motion for intervention and a motion to strike.

This scant factual information is insufficient to determine whether CCPUG should be an intervenor in this proceeding. Section 507 of Title 12 of the Louisiana Revised Statutes, which CCPUG cites in its motion, provides that an unincorporated association may intervene in a proceeding on its own behalf only if (a) one or more members of the unincorporated association have standing to assert an interest in their own right, (b) the interests the unincorporated association seeks to protect are germane to its purposes, and (c) neither the interest asserted nor the relief requested requires the participation of a member.

CCPUG has not made a genuine, serious effort to comply with La. R.S. 12:507, and the Hearing Officer should deny CCPUG's intervention. First, CCPUG has not identified its members so that one can determine whether its members have an interest in this proceeding in their own right. Although the statute refers to "one or more members," CCPUG should have identified all of its members as it has alleged that its members are "large ratepayers" and that an unincorporated association must have multiple members. Second, CCPUG has not identified its purpose and explained how CCPUG's purpose is germane to its members' interests. An unincorporated association must have a common, nonprofit purpose, and CCPUG does not state its purpose or explain the relationship between its purpose and members' interests to be asserted in this proceeding. Third, CCPUG has not explained why its intervention will not require the participation of any of its members. Accordingly, the Hearing Officer cannot determine whether CCPUG has complied with the very statute it cites in its motion, that is, La. R.S. 12:507, and, therefore, should deny CCPUG's intervention.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> La. R.S. 12:501(5).

Id.

Furthermore, CCPUG has not demonstrated that indeed it is even a valid unincorporated association or has authority to intervene in this proceeding. An unincorporated association is not an entity that can be created through pleadings without any formalities so that a group of individuals or businesses can participate in a legal or administrative proceeding under a separate collective name. An unincorporated association must have a governing document setting forth the mutual consent of its members in a common, nonprofit purpose. An unincorporated association's members must elect officers or directors at least once per year; otherwise, the association can be involuntarily dissolved. And, these officers or directors have to manage the association's affairs. Most importantly, an unincorporated association must appear through its president or an officer authorized by its members. Nothing in CCPUG's motion indicates that CCPUG is a valid unincorporated association or has the authority to intervene in this proceeding.

In summary, CCPUG has failed to show that it is entitled to intervene in this proceeding in its own name under the applicable statute, is a valid unincorporated association, or has the authority to intervene in this proceeding. Accordingly, the Hearing Officer should deny CCPUG's motion for intervention.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> La. R.S. 12:501(5); see La. R.S. 12:505(C)(6).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> La. R.S. 12:501(2); La. R.S. 12:514(2).

<sup>6</sup> See La. R.S. 12:514(4).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> La. Code Civ. P. art. 689.

## Respectfully submitted,

Timothy S. Cragin, La. Bar No. 22313

Alyssa Maurice-Anderson, La. Bar No. 28388

Harry M. Barton, La. Bar No. 29751 Brian L. Guillot, La. Bar No. 31759

ENTERGY SERVICES, INC.

639 Loyola Avenue, Mail Unit L-ENT-26E

New Orleans, Louisiana 70113 Telephone: (504) 576-6523 Facsimile: (504) 576-5579

-and-

John F. Williams, Texas Bar No. 21554100 James F. McNally, Jr., Texas Bar No. 13815680 Scott Olson, Texas Bar No. 24013266 DUGGINS WREN MANN & ROMERO, LLP One American Center 600 Congress Avenue, Suite 1900 Austin, Texas 78701 Telephone: (512) 744-9300

Facsimile: (512) 744-9399

-and-

Stephen T. Perrien, La. Bar No. 22590 TAGGART MORTON, L.L.C. 1100 Poydras Street, Suite 2100 New Orleans, Louisiana 70113 Telephone: (504) 599-8500

Facsimile: (504) 599-8501

### ATTORNEYS FOR ENTERGY NEW ORLEANS, LLC

# **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that I have this <u>6th</u> day of <u>November</u> , 2018, served the required number of copies of the foregoing pleading upon all other known parties of this proceeding individually and/or through their attorney of record or other duly designated individual, by: $\boxtimes$ electronic mail, $\square$ facsimile, $\boxtimes$ hand delivery, and/or by depositing same with $\boxtimes$ overnight mail carrier, or $\square$ the United States Postal Service, postage prepaid.		
Lora W. Johnson, CMC, LMMC Clerk of Council City Hall – Room 1E09 1300 Perdido Street New Orleans, LA 70112	Hon. Jeffrey S. Gulin 3203 Bridle Ridge Lane Lutherville, MD 21093	
Erin Spears Bobbie Mason Connolly F. A. Reed City Hall – Room 6E07 1300 Perdido Street New Orleans, LA 70112	David Gavlinski Council Chief of Staff City Hall – Room 1E06 1300 Perdido Street New Orleans, LA 70112	
Sunni LeBeouf Law Department City Hall - 5th Floor 1300 Perdido Street New Orleans, LA 70112	Norman White Department of Finance City Hall – Room 3E06 1300 Perdido Street New Orleans, LA 70112	
Clinton A. Vince Presley Reed Emma F. Hand 1900 K Street NW Washington, DC 20006	Basile J. Uddo J.A. "Jay" Beatmann, Jr. c/o Dentons US LLP 650 Poydras Street, Suite 2850 New Orleans, LA 70130	
Errol Smith Bruno and Tervalon 4298 Elysian Fields Avenue New Orleans, LA 70122	Philip J. Movish Joseph W. Rogers Victor M. Prep Legend Consulting Group 8055 East Tufts Ave., Suite 1250 Denver, CO 80237-2835	

Gary E. Huntley Polly S. Rosemond Derek Mills Seth Cureington Entergy New Orleans, LLC 1600 Perdido Street, L-MAG-505B New Orleans, LA 70112

Joe Romano, III Suzanne Fontan Therese Perrault Entergy Services 639 Loyola Ave. Mail Unit L-ENT-4C New Orleans, LA 70113

Logan Atkinson Burke Sophie Zaken Alliance for Affordable Energy 4505 S. Claiborne Avenue New Orleans, LA 70125

Carrie R. Tournillon KEAN MILLER LLP 900 Poydras Street, Suite 3600 New Orleans, LA 70112

Myron Katz, PhD 302 Walnut Street New Orleans, LA 70118

Benjamin Quimby 1621 S. Rampart St. New Orleans, LA 70113

Maurice Brubaker Brubaker & Associates, Inc. P.O. Box 412000 (63141-2000) 16690 Swingly Ridge Road, Suite 140 Chesterfield, MO 63017 Timothy S. Cragin Alyssa Maurice-Anderson Brian L. Guillot Harry Barton Entergy Services, LLC 639 Loyola Ave., Mail Unit L-ENT-26E New Orleans, LA 70113

Michael J. Laughlin Mary Katherine Kaufman Churita H. Hansell Cherrell Simms Taplin City Hall – Room 5E03 1300 Perdido Street New Orleans, LA 70112

Katherine W. King Randy Young KEAN MILLER LLP 400 Convention Street, Suite 700 (70802) Post Office Box 3513 Baton Rouge, LA 70821-3513

Mark Zimmerman Air Products & Chemicals, Inc. 720 I. Hamilton Blvd. Allentown, PA 18195-1501

Andy Kowalczyk 1115 Congress St. New Orleans, LA 70117

Renate Heurich 1407 Napoleon Ave, #C New Orleans, LA 70115

Alyssa Maurice-Anderson